

**IDAHO REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD**  
**Bureau of Occupational Licenses**  
700 West State Street, P.O. Box 83720  
Boise, ID 83720-0063

**Board Meeting Minutes of 6/4/2019**

**BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:** Paul J Morgan - Chair  
H Scott Calhoun  
Brent Lee Stanger  
B Jane McClaran  
Eric J Brinton

**BUREAU STAFF:** Kelley Packer, Bureau Chief  
Julie Eavenson, Administrative Support Manager  
Lori Peel, Investigative Unit Manager  
Nicholas Krema, General Counsel  
Rob McQuade, Legal Counsel  
Eric Nelson, Board Prosecutor  
Cesley Metcalfe, Board Specialist

The meeting was called to order at 8:32 AM MDT by Paul J Morgan.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Ms. McClaran made a motion to approve the minutes of April 17, 2019 and May 18, 2019. It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Motion carried.

**DISCIPLINE**

Mr. Nelson presented a memorandum regarding case number REA-2019-5. After discussion, the Board gave recommendations for appropriate discipline.

Mr. Calhoun joined the meeting at 8:41 AM MDT.

Mr. Nelson presented a memorandum regarding case number REA-2019-6. After discussion, the Board gave recommendations for appropriate discipline.

Mr. Nelson presented a Stipulation and Consent Order in case number REA-2019-2. Mr. Stanger made a motion to approve the Consent Order and allow the Board Chair to sign on behalf of the Board. It was seconded by Ms. McClaran. Motion carried. Mr. Morgan will review the quarterly appraisal logs required during the probation period.

## **FINANCIAL REPORT**

Ms. Eavenson gave the financial report, which indicated that the Board had a cash balance of \$778,675.12 as of April 30, 2019.

## **BOARD APPOINTMENTS**

Ms. Eavenson covered the Board member appointment process and the need to submit a new application if a person is seeking reappointment.

## **INVESTIGATIVE REPORT**

Ms. Peel gave the investigative report, which is linked above.

## **FOR BOARD DETERMINATION**

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to approve the Bureau's recommendation and authorize closure in cases I-REA-2019-4, I-REA-2019-19 and I-REA-2019-20. It was seconded by Mr. Stanger. Motion carried. Mr. Brinton was recused.

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to accept the CEU Settlement in case REA-2019-7 and authorize the Board Chair to sign on behalf of the Board. It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Motion carried.

The Board reviewed a probation termination request in case REA-2017-9. Mr. Calhoun made a motion to deny the request pending resolution of an open case. It was seconded by Mr. Stanger. Mr. Brinton was recused.

## **OLD BUSINESS**

The Board reviewed the To Do List and no action was taken.

## **NEW BUSINESS**

## **APPRAISAL SUBCOMMITTEE PRELIMINARY REPORT**

The Appraisal Subcommittee (ASC) staff conducted an ASC Compliance Review of the Idaho appraiser regulatory program and the Idaho appraisal management company program on April 15-17, 2019 to determine the programs' compliance with Title XI of the Financial Institutions Reform, Recovery, and Enforcement Act of 1989, as amended. The Board reviewed the preliminary ASC Compliance Review Report and discussed appropriate responses to the findings.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Mr. Calhoun made a motion that the Board go into executive session under Idaho Code § 74-206(1)(d) to consider records that are exempt from disclosure under the Idaho Public Records Law. The purpose of the executive session was to consider license application materials. It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. The vote was: Mr. Morgan, aye; Mr. Calhoun, aye; Ms. McClaran, aye; Mr. Stanger, aye; and Mr. Brinton, aye. Motion carried.

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to come out of executive session. It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Motion carried.

Ms. McClaran made a motion directing Bureau staff to send a letter to a licensee informing him of the following: his education does not appear to meet the minimum state or federal requirements for licensure; he needs to submit documentation of proof that he has met the minimum requirements or obtain the required education to meet the minimum requirements and submit proof of having done so; his appraiser credential will be made inactive on the National Registry until proof of meeting the minimum requirements has been provided; and his Idaho appraiser license will be over-stamped to indicate that he is not eligible to work on federally-related transactions until his appraiser credential is reinstated on the National Registry. It was seconded by Mr. Stanger. Motion carried.

## **APPRAISAL MANAGEMENT COMPANY APPLICATION AND FORM REVIEW**

The Board reviewed updates to the Appraisal Management Company (AMC) application and renewal forms. Mr. Calhoun made a motion to approve the revised AMC application and the revised AMC renewal form. It was seconded by Ms. McClaran. Motion carried.

## **ASSOCIATION OF APPRAISAL REGULATORY OFFICIALS (AARO) 2019 SPRING CONFERENCE**

Mr. Calhoun and Mr. Brinton provided brief updates on topics discussed at the AARO 2019 Spring Conference.

Mr. Calhoun stated that the Practical Applications for Real Estate Appraisal (PAREA) will be an alternative method for trainees and appraisers to obtain experience hours in a classroom setting. The models shown at the conference seemed very similar to education, rather than the more immersive concept that has previously been discussed. There was also discussion on the possibility of allowing bifurcated appraisals, which would allow an appraiser to utilize a third-party inspection in lieu of the appraiser personally inspecting the property, if the use of the third-party inspection is properly disclosed in the appraisal report.

Mr. Brinton stated that alterations to the Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac forms are being discussed that will provide additional space for appraisers to include notes that will: address the expansion of intended users; accommodate bifurcated appraisals, and allow modifications to the certification sections. Mr. Brinton also stated that it may be difficult for states to regulate bifurcated appraisals because they may raise questions of jurisdiction. Mr. Brinton also stated that Mr. Calhoun did a very good job representing Idaho as a panelist during an appraisal management company discussion at the conference.

## **CORRESPONDENCE**

The Board reviewed correspondence from Dustin Harris regarding long-distance trainee supervision. Mr. Calhoun made a motion directing the Bureau to respond that the Board does not offer legal opinions and that Mr. Harris may wish to seek legal advice for clarification. It was seconded by Ms. McClaran. Motion carried.

The Board reviewed correspondence from the Appraisal Foundation regarding the use of calculators during examinations. The Board directed the Bureau to forward the correspondence to Pearson Vue.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Mr. Calhoun made a motion that the Board go into executive session under Idaho Code § 74-206(1)(d) to consider records that are exempt from disclosure under the Idaho Public Records Law. The purpose of the executive session was to consider license application materials. It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. The vote was: Mr. Morgan, aye; Mr. Calhoun, aye; Ms. McClaran, aye; Mr. Stanger, aye; and Mr. Brinton, aye. Motion carried.

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to come out of executive session. It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Motion carried.

## **APPLICATIONS**

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to approve the following for the CRA examination:

901148800

And the following for the LRA examination:

901139354

It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Motion carried.

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to table the following pending receipt of additional information:

901046334

It was seconded by Mr. Stanger. Motion carried.

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to approve the following pending receipt of additional information:

901167243

It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Motion carried.

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to approve the following for the CRA examination:

901161951

It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Motion carried.

**NEXT MEETING** was scheduled for August 12, 2019 at 8:30 AM MDT.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

Ms. McClaran made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 12:59 PM MDT. It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Motion carried.

---

Paul J Morgan, Chair

---

H Scott Calhoun

---

Brent Lee Stanger

---

B Jane McClaran

---

Eric J Brinton

---

Kelley Packer, Bureau Chief